**Integrated Impact Assessment (IIA)**

**Informing our approach to fairness**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name of proposals** | Parking Services – Going fully cashless for parking charges |
| **Date of assessment** | Aug 22 |
| **Lead officer**  | Lynne Ryan |
| **Assessment team** | Russell Nelson, John Skeen |
| **Planned review date** | Sep-23 |

**Version control**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Version** | 3 |
| **Date** | May-23 |
| **Replaces version** | 2 of Sep 22 |

****

|  |
| --- |
|  |
| **Section A: Current service** |
| 1. **What does the service / function / policy do?**
 |
| Parking Services is within the Operations and Regulatory Services Directorate and provides a number of key services to support the city. Our priority is to provide a high-quality parking service that meets the needs of residents, businesses, visitors and staff.Parking Services is split into the following operational areas:* Car Parking Enforcement –Managing on-street parking and off-street car parks. This includes issuing Penalty Charge Notices (PCNs) for all parking contraventions, providing support for events, implementing parking dispensations and suspensions monitoring and enforcement of the Blue Badge scheme
* Parking/bus lane enforcement and Notice Processing.
* Informal Team – Processing informal challenges, administration of resident parking schemes and general parking enquiries.
* Formal Team – Processing formal challenges against PCNs
* Shopmobility – providing access to the city centre amenities for those persons with reduced mobility.
* Service Development – responsible for financial reconciliation, budget management, Complaints and FOI requests
* Travel Office – Provision of a range of sustainable travel initiatives for staff to support personal and business needs.
 |
| 1. **Who do you deliver this service for?**
 |
| The service helps provide parking for a range of stakeholders across the city. This includes residents, businesses, shoppers and other visitors attracted to the city. |
| 1. **Do you have any statutory requirements?**
 |
| TBC |
| 1. **How much do you spend on this service?**
 |
|  |
| **Gross expenditure** | **Gross income** | **Net budget** | **Capital projects** |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |
| 1. **What workforce delivers this service?**
 |
| **Posts** | **FTEs** | **Comments** |
|  |  |  |
| **Section B: Change proposal** |
| 1. **What is the proposal to change the service?**
 |
| This IIA reviews the removal of coin payments from all parking locations (on, off and MSCP) where charges exist, ultimately making Parking Services fully cashless for parking charges.**Background**When parking in a Newcastle City Council chargeable parking bay, customers have the option of paying for their parking by coin at the ticket machine at every location. Currently the Council has approx 339 ticket machines. These all accept coin payments, where the customer chooses in advance the duration of their stay, makes the relevant payment and receives a ticket to display on their vehicle dashboard.PayByPhoneThe option to pay using a mobile phone (predominantly via an app) is provided by PayByPhone and was first introduced in Newcastle City Council parking places in January 2014. Since then, its growth – in terms of usage per site, as well as rolling out to new locations, has increased significantly. Using a phone means enables the user to pay without the need for coins, and extend any expiry time remotely. PayByPhone is available in all council car parks and on street parking places in the city centre. Its popularity is very high compared to coin at all locations where it is available. In 2022/23 there were almost 3 million transactions.Card machinesTicket machines were upgraded in October 2016 and February 2017 at our two busiest car parks – Eldon Square MSCP and Eldon Garden MSCP – to allow card payments. This is through our check in check out (CiCo) system, where the customers check-in when they arrive, and then check-out when leaving. The benefits are:* Don’t have to carry loose change
* Don’t have to guess how long you will be
* Can’t get a Penalty Charge Notice for overstaying
* Don’t have to rush back to a vehicle because an expiry time is looming
* Get charged to the exact minute parked to the exact penny

Like PayByPhone, CiCo is very popular. In both Eldon car parks, almost 95% of all transactions occur either by PBP or card.Due to its success, the system has recently been rolled out to a further 6 car parks – selected due to the volume of car parking there, the number of PCNs issued for overstaying in order to reduce this, and their proximity to amenities such as hospitals and shops.The business case is already approved to roll out the system to a further 4 car parks.As part of the roll out, Parking Services have reduced the overall number of ticket machines in the car parks. As customers need to input their vehicle registration at the ticket machine for both coin and card payments, there is no longer a need to display your ticket in the vehicle dashboard, meaning machines can now be just positioned at every exit point, rather than having multiple of repeat machines throughout the car park. All the card enabled ticket machines currently allow coin payments.2022/23 saw almost 80% of parking transactional value come from cashless v coin.**The Proposal**Parking Services have recently reduced the overall number of ticket machines in the car parks. Once the 4 remaining car parks have the card enabled machined installed, this will leave approx 335 machines that are coin only across the city. As the overall number of cashless payments increase each month (customers using card or PayByPhone instead of cash), this means banking fees increase as we are charged a fee for each transaction. In order to ensure value for money, as well as providing card machines and the popular cashless payment systems at all parking locations, it is desirable to stop coin payments completely. This helps by saving the cost of cash collection, counting and banking of the coins collected. By going cashless, when we upgrade the existing ticket machines it will be via a new door which contains a card reader etc, but no coin slot. If the new doors also contained coin slots, the upgrades would be more expensive. It also meets the Council’s aspirations to be a cashless Council.The current cash collection service is also unlikely to continue indefinitely, meaning Parking Services needs to look at alternative options and the Council is being requested by the bank we deposit coins with, to reduce and ultimately stop coin collections.In addition, as card enabled machines require a vehicle registration to be added at the ticket machine, this also helps with smarter and more efficient enforcement. It is therefore proposed to:* Roll out PayByPhone to the remaining on street locations where it isn’t yet provided (subject to checking any signal issues)
* Roll out card enabled machines to the majority of remaining locations. This will be:
	+ ‘pre-pay’ available at every location (selecting in advance the length of time they want to park for and paying using a bank card)
	+ Check in check out (check in upon arrival and check out when leaving) available in addition to the pre-pay option, but only at car parks with no maximum stay restrictions
* All machines would either have the coin function disabled (if an existing card machine), or would just be card only from the outset (for the new machines)
* Consideration is being given (and would require further consultation) to whether approx. 20-30 locations may become PayByPhone only. These would only be in the following 2 circumstances:
	+ There are 5 or less parking bays
	+ The location is in close proximity to alternative parking locations (on or off-street) where card machines are available

Consultation has taken place to remove coin though press and site notices. |
| 1. **What evidence has informed this proposal?**
 |
| **Information source** | **What has this told you?** |
| Current costs providing coin collections and potential end of service | That providing a coin option is unstainable in the long term |
| Current parking cashless usage across the Council | The overwhelming majority of transactions and income occur from cashless payment systems and this continues to grow |
| Other Local Authorities | Other Local Authorities are cashless and haven’t experienced any issues going cashless, including Manchester City Council, Chelmsford Council, Redbridge Council and Lambeth Council |
| Private car park operators in the city | A range of car parks are cashless. |
| 1. **How much will you spend on this service?**
 |
|  | **Gross expenditure** | **Gross income** | **Net budget** | **Capital projects** |
|  |
|  |  |  |  | £0 |
|  |
| **4. What will the net savings be of this proposal?** |
|  | **Gross Saving** | **Implementation Cost** | **Net Saving** |
|  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |
| **5. What impact will this have on the workforce?** |
|  | **No. FTEs** | **% workforce** |  |
| **2019-20** |  |  |

|  |
| --- |
| 1. **Who have you engaged with about this proposal?**
 |
| **Date** | **Who**  | **No. of people** | **Main issues raised** |
| 9/3/22 | Newcastle Disability Forum | 5 | Small % of coin users is still a reasonable sum of peoplePotential human rights issue (NCC legal services have confirmed that going cashless is not a human rights issue)Need to cater for those that want to pay by coin/can only pay by coin if possible – and it might put people off coming into town |
| October 22 | The Elders Council | Several | May marginalise someCould some coin machines be maintainedWhat happens if not tech savvy or issues with the app |
| 7 Nov 22 | Standard 21 technical consultees |  | Being PayByPhone onlyThose (particularly the elderly) who may not be confident or safe using card readersMobile signal in some areas of the city |
| Mar 23 | Site and press notices | 146 objections46 in support33 general comments | Proposal is a cost saving exercise onlyProposals are discriminatoryDon’t have a smart phoneDon’t have a bank accountWant to be able to continue to use coins / it is legal tenderCoin payments are easier to keep track of spendCash is legal tenderPaying over the phone is unreliable / phone number should always be availablePhone apps charge fees / banking fees associatedPhone signal coverageMachines can be slow/queuesWould struggle to enter vehicle registration into machine due to disabilityThe reserve paymentFeel unsafe using/carrying card and don’t always carry a card/phoneDon’t want to give out personal dataPossible fraudNo money in account/overdrawnSystems crashCan some locations continue to accept coin (e.g. parks)Would have detrimental impact on the city’s economy |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| 1. **What are the potential impacts of the proposal?**
 |
| **Specific group / subject** | **Impact** (actual / potential disadvantage, beneficial outcome or none) | **Detail of impact** | **How will you address or mitigate disadvantage?** |
| **People with protected characteristics** |
| Disability | Actual/Potential disadvantage | May not have access to a smart phoneMay not have access to a bank cardMay not be confident or feel able to use card at a ticket machine or PayByPhone | PayByPhone can be accessed through any phone and by ringing a number – doesn’t need to be through the app Card payment machines will be available in addition to PayByPhone. Paying by card means paying for the exact time parked (when parking in a car park with no restriction.)For those that struggle with using the ticket machines, or using PayByPhone, officers from Parking Services would be willing to explore alternative be-spoke options with any individual.The council also provides free classes for general help regarding ‘getting online.’ Courses must be booked either by call on 0191 277 8842 (Mon to Fri, 10am – 2pm), or online [Get Online Newcastle page](https://www.newcastle.gov.uk/services/libraries-culture/using-library-computer/get-online-newcastle)Central Library also offers a range of support – including how to use a smart phone and how to download an app, and they can also provide support in showing how to make a PayByPhone payment.Parking is free after 7pm within the Clean Air Zone, or 6pm/6:30pm outside of the Clean Air Zone which would mean those attending night time economy activities including events, theatres, cinemas and restaurants do not need to pay for parking after these charging periodsWebsite will include video demonstrations of how to use the ticket machines and PaybyPhonePre-paid bank cards can be used at both the ticket machine and with PayByPhone and can be obtained from a variety of sources with no requirement for a bank accountParking remains free on street for those with a blue badge |
| Disability | Actual/potential advantage | The check in check out facility is the most popular payment system for blue badge holders from a survey undertaken. Rolling this is out to the remaining car parks that don’t currently have will ensure all blue badge holders fully benefit from the 1 hour free period (it gets deducted from the final charge) as well as not having to rush back due to an expiring ticket. |  |
| Age | Actual/Potential disadvantage | May not have access to a smart phoneMay not have access to a bank cardMay not be confident using card at a ticket machine or PayByPhone | PayByPhone can be accessed through any phone and by ringing a number – doesn’t need to be through the app Card payment machines will be available in addition to PayByPhone. Paying by card means paying for the exact time parked (when parking in a car park with no restriction.)For those that struggle with using the ticket machines, or using PayByPhone, officers from Parking Services would be willing to explore alternative be-spoke options with any individual.The council also provides free classes for general help regarding ‘getting online.’ Courses must be booked either by call on 0191 277 8842 (Mon to Fri, 10am – 2pm), or online [Get Online Newcastle page](https://www.newcastle.gov.uk/services/libraries-culture/using-library-computer/get-online-newcastle)Central Library also offers a range of support – including how to use a smart phone and how to download an app, and they can also provide support in showing how to make a PayByPhone payment.Parking is free after 7pm within the Clean Air Zone, or 6pm/6:30pm outside of the Clean Air Zone which would mean those attending night time economy activities including events, theatres, cinemas and restaurants do not need to pay for parking after these charging periodsWebsite will include video demonstrations of how to use the ticket machines and PaybyPhonePre-paid bank cards can be used at both the ticket machine and with PayByPhone and can be obtained from a variety of sources with no requirement for a bank account |
|  |
|  |  |  |  |
| People vulnerable to socio-economic impacts | Actual/Potential disadvantage for older people | May not have access to a smart phoneMay not have access to a bank card or may not have funds in their account to pay for parking | PayByPhone can be accessed through any phone and by ringing a number – doesn’t need to be through the app Card payment machines will be available in addition to PayByPhone. Paying by card means paying for the exact time parked (when parking in a car park with no restriction.)Parking is free after 7pm within the Clean Air Zone, or 6pm/6:30pm outside of the Clean Air Zone which would mean those attending night time economy activities including events, theatres, cinemas and restaurants do not need to pay for parking after these charging periodsWebsite will include video demonstrations of how to use the ticket machines and PaybyPhonePre-paid bank cards can be used at both the ticket machine and with PayByPhone and can be obtained from a variety of sources with no requirement for a bank account |
|  |